IGINAL

25

26

27

28

FACTS RELEVANT TO THIS MOTION

1. Robert A. Bisom is an individual currently residing in Japan. See Declaration of Robert A. Bisom filed in Case No. 05-84-N-EJL, United States District Court for the District of Idaho, a true and correct copy of which is attached hereto. The Idaho proceedings were

6

10

11 12

14 15

13

16 17

18 19

20

21

22 23

24 25

26

27 28 dismissed for lack of jurisdiction and the present case was re-filed in this Court.

- 2. On November 18, 2005, this Court denied plaintiff's first motion to enter Mr. Bisom's default, finding that Jay Sorensen was not Mr. Bisom's attorney in this matter and that plaintiff's attempted service on Sorensen at Attorney Sorensen's address in California intended to obtain service on Mr. Bisom was ineffective.
- 3. Undaunted, plaintiff filed for and obtained an order allowing plaintiff to serve Mr. Bisom by publication notwithstanding plaintiff's prior knowledge, undisclosed by plaintiff to the Court, that Robert Bisom resides in Japan, and notwithstanding that plaintiff's only attempt to serve Robert Bisom otherwise had been by the defective service of a summons and complaint on Jay Sorensen. See Motion to Serve Robert A. Bisom by Publication and Affidavit in Support both filed December 9, 2005; Order dated January 13, 2006.
- 4. Plaintiff published his notice in the Saipan Tribune for four consecutive weeks during which time no complaint was pending against Robert A. Bisom. See Declaration of Kristin D. St. Peter in Support of Motion to Quash dated April 25, 2006.
- 5. Japan is a signatory to the Hague Convention on the Service Abroad of Judicial and Extrajudicial Documents in Civil or Commercial Matters, 28 U.S.C. (Appendix following Fed. R. Civ. P. 4); 20 U.S.T. 361, T.I.A.S. No. 6638 (the "Hague Convention").

ARGUMENT

The arguments made by Andrew Clayton in his Motion to Quash Service in this case are equally applicable to Mr. Bisom here:

- 1. Plaintiff's case had been dismissed and no complaint was on file during the time plaintiff published his notice in the Saipan Tribune; and
- 2. Plaintiff has failed to comply with the provisions of Rule 4(f) requiring that plaintiff serve Robert Bisom consistent with the provisions of the Hague Convention.

Additionally, and notwithstanding that service by publication is inconsistent with the provisions of the Hague Convention as they apply to residents of Japan, plaintiff did not properly demonstrate that he met the statutory requirements that would allow service by

4

5

8

10

11 12

13

15 16

17 18

19 20

21 22

24 25

23

27

28

26

publication on Robert A. Bisom in this case.

Title 7, Section 1102(b) of the Commonwealth Code provides that substituted service may be made pursuant to the provisions of 7 C.M.C. § 1104 "if the person cannot be found in the Commonwealth." Section 1104(b) states in full:

After service on the Attorney General, if the defendant cannot be personally served by mail the summons and complaint, and if by affidavit or otherwise the court is satisfied that with reasonable diligence the defendant cannot be served, and that a cause of action arises against the party upon whom service is to be made, or he is a necessary and proper party to the action, the court may order that service be made by publication of the summons in at least one newspaper published and having a general circulation in the Commonwealth. Publication shall be made once each week for four successive weeks, and the last publication shall be not less than 21 days prior to the return date stated herein.

Here, plaintiff did not demonstrate his efforts to properly serve Bisom; instead he relied solely on his previously debunked, improper efforts to serve Bisom through defendant Jay Sorensen, and Jay Sorensen's continuing communication with Robert A. Bisom, despite the fact that he knows that Sorensen is not representing Bisom in this matter.

No other efforts whatsoever to serve Robert Bisom are identified in plaintiff's Motion to Serve Robert A. Bisom by Publication and plaintiff's supporting Affidavit. Plaintiff did not allege attempted service in any other place or in any other manner, by personal service, by mail, by waiver, through the Hague Convention or otherwise. Indeed, Plaintiff did not even allege that Robert A. Bisom cannot be found in the Commonwealth. See 7 C.M.C. § 1102(b).

Further, there was no demonstration by the plaintiff, and there was no express finding by the Court, that a cause of action has arisen against Robert Bisom and in favor of plaintiff that would satisfy the statutory requirement. Indeed, given the previous dismissal of this case and upcoming consideration of the efficacy of plaintiff's Second Amended Complaint, it is at the very least questionable whether Robert A. Bisom should be served by publication at this stage notwithstanding that the plaintiff has failed to meet the statutory requirements that would otherwise allow such substituted service were it not for the Hague Convention.

In short, plaintiff has yet to effect proper service on Robert A. Bisom and, accordingly, his motion to have Mr. Bisom's default entered and for an award of monetary damages (wholly unwarranted and unsupported) must be denied. Respectfully submitted this 4th day of May, 2006. Saipan, MP 96950 Telephone: (670 Facsimile:

MARK B. HANSON First Floor, Macaranas Building Beach Road, Garapan PMB 738, P.O. Box 10,000

(670) 233-8600 (670) 233-5262

Appearing Specially for Robert A. Bisom

1 CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE 2 I, Rowena de Vera, hereby certify that this day a copy of the foregoing was deposited 3 in the United States Post Office, first class mail, postage prepaid, addressed to the following: 4 Robert D. Bradshaw, Plaintiff pro se 5 P.O. Box 473 6 1530 W. Trout Creek Road Calder, Idaho 83808 8 Kristin D. St. Peter, Assistant Attorney General Office of the Attorney General 9 Civil Division—Capitol Hill 10 Second Floor, Juan A. Sablan Memorial Building Caller Box 10007 11 Saipan, MP 96950 12 Jay H. Sorensen, Esq. 13 c/o Shanghai 14 Post Office Box 9022 Warren, MI 48090-9022 15 16 Patrick G. Civille, Esq. Civille and Tang, PLLC 17 330 Herman Cortez Ave., Suite 200 18 Hagatna, Guam 96910 19 20 DATED: May 4, 2006 21 ROWENA DE VERA 22 23 24 25

26

27

28

Case 2:05-cv-00084-EJL-LMB

Document 31

Filed 06/09/2005

Page 1 of 5

MARC A. LYONS, ISB #3145 RUDY J. VERSCHOOR, ISB #5838 RAMSDEN & LYONS 618 North 4th Street Post Office Box 1336 Coeur d'Alene, Idaho 83816-1336 Telephone: (208) 664-5818

Facsimile: (208) 664-5884

Attorneys for Defendant - Robert A. Bisom

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

DISTRICT OF IDAHO

ROBERT D. BRADSHAW,

Plaintiff,

vs.

COMMONWEALTH OF THE NORTHERN MARIANA ISLANDS (hereafter referred to as the CNMI); NICOLE C. FORELLI, former Acting Attorney General of the CNMI, in her personal/individual capacity: WILLIAM C. BUSH, former Assistant Attorney General of the CNMI, in his personal/individual capacity; L. DAVID SOSEBEE, former Assistant Attorney General of the CNMI, in his personal/individual capacity; ANDREW CLAYTON, former Assistant Attorney General of the CNMI, in his personal/ individual capacity; Other UNKNOWN and UNNAMED person or persons in the CNMI OFFICE OF THE ATTORNEY GENERAL, in their personal/individual capacity, in 1996-2002; ALEXANDRO C. CASTRO, former Judge Pro Tem of the CNMI SUPERIOR COURT, in his personal/individual capacity; JOHN A. MANGLONA, Associate Justice of the CNMI SUPREME COURT, in his

Case No. 05-84-N-EJL

DECLARATION OF ROBERT A.
BISOM IN SUPPORT OF HIS
MOTION TO DISMISS BASED ON
LACK OF PERSONAL
JURISDICTION (F.R.C.P. 12(B)(2)),
IMPROPER VENUE (F.R.C.P. 12(B)
(3)), AND INSUFFICIENCY OF
SERVICE OR PROCESS (F.R.C.P.
12(B)(5)).

Case 2:05-cv-00084-EJL-LMB Document 31 Filed 06/09/2005 Page 2 of 5

personal/individual capacity; TIMOTHY H. BELLAS, former Justice Pro Tem of the CNMI SUPREME COURT, in his personal /individual capacity; ROBERT A. BISON; JAY H. SORENSEN, and the UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF INTERIOR.

Defendants.

- I, Robert A. Bisom, declare as follows:
- 1. I have personal knowledge of the information contained in this declaration.
- 2. I am a teacher living in Japan. I have been living in Japan since 1997.
- Prior to moving to Japan, I lived in Saipan, CNMI. I lived in Saipan from 1993 to 1997.
- 4. My domicile or legal residence at this time is Japan.
- 5. I am slightly familiar with the allegations made in the Amended Complaint by Robert A. Bradshaw against me in Case CV 05-84-N-EJL. The various counts alleged against me, Counts 12, 13, and 15-18 stem from events associated with the lawsuit between myself and Robert Bradshaw. Jay Sorensen represented me in that case which was filed and adjudicated in the Superior Court of the Commonwealth of the Northern Mariana Islands. All actions I took in connection with that case occurred in the CNMI.
- 6. I did not have any connections with the state of Idaho prior to contacting the firm of Ramsden & Lyons to represent me in this action.

- 7. I have never lived in the state of Idaho, nor have I ever been inside the borders of the state of Idaho. Idaho is not my residence or domicile, nor do I have a dwelling house or usual place of abode in Idaho.
- I have never committed or directed any tort or similar action against the state of Idaho or anyone in the state of Idaho.
- I have never conducted business in Idaho, availed myself of the benefits of the state of Idaho and have never incurred any obligation to pay taxes in the state of Idaho.
- 10. I have not been served with the Summons and Amended Complaint in this action. I have not received a copy of the Summons. I have received a copy of the first 2 pages of the Amended Complaint from Mr. Jay Sorensen. I have never authorized Cynthia Sorensen to act as my agent, employee, or to accept service of process on my behalf.
- 11. The house at which the Summons and Amended Complaint were served is a house that I have been told formerly belonged to the mother of Jay Sorensen before she died last year. I have never lived in that house. That house has never been my residence, domicile, dwelling house, or usual place of abode.
- 12. I do not consent to the personal jurisdiction of courts of the state of Idaho or federal court located in Idaho.
- 13. No state or federal court in Idaho has ever found the exercise of personal jurisdiction over me.

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the United States of America that the foregoing is true and correct.

Executed on May 21, 2005 at JAPAN

Robert A. Bisom

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on June 9, 2005, I electronically filed the foregoing city the Clerk of the Court using the CM/ECF system which sent a Notice of Electronic Filing to the following persons:

Candy W Dale (cwd@hallfarley.com krt@hallfarley.com)

Matthew J Ryden (mjr@hallfarley.com ccv@hallfarley.com)

And, I hereby certify that I have mailed by United States Postal Service the foregoing document(s) to the following non-CM/ECF Registered Participant(s):

Robert D Bradshaw P O Box 473 Calder, ID 83808

/s/Marc A. Lyons	
Marc A. Lyons	